



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/902,904	07/11/2001	Steven B Dunn	MBI-1064	9657
21302 7590 02/14/2012 KNOBLE, YOSHIDA & DUNLEAVY EIGHT PENN CENTER SUITE 1350, 1628 JOHN F KENNEDY BLVD PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103				
EXAMINER				
GRAVINI, STEPHEN MICHAEL				
ART UNIT		PAPER NUMBER		
3744				
MAIL DATE		DELIVERY MODE		
02/14/2012		PAPER		

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Office Action Summary**Application No.**

09/902,904

Applicant(s)

DUNN ET AL.

Examiner

Stephen M. Gravini

Art Unit

3744

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --
Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
 - If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
 - Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).
- Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 09 January 2012.
- 2a) ☒ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☐ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ An election was made by the applicant in response to a restriction requirement set forth during the interview on ____; the restriction requirement and election have been incorporated into this action.
- 4) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 5) ☒ Claim(s) 9, 10, 19, 20 and 29 is/are pending in the application.
- 5a) Of the above claim(s) ____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 9, 10 and 29 is/are allowed.
- 7) ☒ Claim(s) 19 and 20 is/are rejected.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) ____ is/are objected to.
- 9) ☐ Claim(s) ____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 10) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 11) ☒ The drawing(s) filed on 09 January 2012 is/are: a) ☒ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 12) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 13) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. ____.
 3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).
- * See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- 1) ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- 3) ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SF/86)
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date ____
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application
- 6) ☐ Other: ____
- Paper No(s)/Mail Date ____

DETAILED ACTION

The text of those sections of Title 35, U.S. Code not included in this action can be found in a prior Office action.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

Claims 19-20 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being unpatentable over Gates (US 2,197,178). The "means for" language is construed to invoke the sixth paragraph of the 35 USC 112, because of its recitation being modified by functional language and not modified by sufficient acts, structure, or material. The claims are reasonably and broadly construed, in light of the accompanying specification, to be disclosed by Gates as comprising:

a tray **1** having a bottom face that is adapted to be supported by an underlying surface and an upper face (figure 2, page 1 line 8);

bottle support means **15** for supporting a baby bottle (figure 1, page 2 line 6); and

disk holding means **15**, connected to said upper face of said tray, for holding baby bottle disks in a location that is isolated from areas of said tray in which liquid may collect, whereby baby bottle disks are and stored in a safe manner at a location that is convenient to a location at which baby bottles are being dried (figure 1, page 2, left column, line 6 and lines 61-70). Gates also discloses the claimed disk holding means comprising an upstanding boss member that is raised from said upper face of said tray, and a plurality of disk-receiving slots defined in said boss member (figure 1, page 2 line 6).

Response to Arguments

Applicant's arguments filed January 9, 2012 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.

Gates anticipation

Applicants argue that each claim 19 element should be separately considered in light of the prior art reference Gates. As best shown in applicants' figure 1, the "tray" is shown by reference character 12, the "bottle support means" is shown by reference character 18, and the "disk holding means" is shown by anyone of reference characters 18, 32, and 54. The functional language that follows the "disk holding means" does not distinguish it from the bottle support means. In column 3, third full paragraph of the specification, it states "ring support members 32 are, in a manner that is substantially identical to that of pegs 18." In this application, the support means and holding means are recited as being interchangeable as discussed in the specification. Therefore the rejection is proper to construe an interchangeable claim element with an interchangeable teaching of those elements.

The claims are reasonably and broadly construed, in light of the accompanying specification such that support means and holding means are disclosed by Gates. As claimed, the "bottle support means" functionally recites "for supporting a baby bottle." As rejected, the disclosed trough 15 is a means that structurally and functionally is a teaching for supporting a baby bottle. Applicants arguments that Gates element would not support a bottle with a peg or support of some sort. Those features are not claimed. Gates teaching supports a bottle as claimed.

Assuming *arguendo*, that the claimed disk holding means is recited as a separate element and should be rejected by a separate element, then Gates teaches a disk holding means as claimed. Structurally and functionally the disk holding means is connected to an upper face of a tray for holding baby bottle disks in a location that is isolated from areas of said tray in which liquid may collect, whereby baby bottle disks are and stored in a safe manner at a location that is convenient to a location at which baby bottles are being dried. The described location in the claim is not construed to structurally or functionally limit the claim because it is a subjective claim element. In other words the claimed "safe manner" and "convenient" location do not distinguish the claim. Under the rejection, the disclosed upstanding ribs 17 (figure 5), meet the claimed disk holding means because that teaching shows that the holding means is connected to said tray upper face and capable of holding baby bottle disks as claimed. Applicants argue that the specification "disk holding system 50" distinguishes the claimed invention over the prior art. However, what is claimed is a "disk holding means" which is give a broader claim construction. Although not discussed in the rejection, another "disk holding means" is shown in figure 5 of Gates as reference character 26a. That teaching meets the structure and function of the claimed disk holding means.

In response to applicants arguments with respect to the claimed boss members and slots, that feature is met by the disclosed trough and rack because the trough is raised and the rack contains slots. The boss member and slots is further met by the teachings of Gates figure 5 because the upstanding ribs are boss members that form a slot.

For these reasons the rejection of claims 19-20 by Gates is maintained.

Conclusion

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Stephen M. Gravini whose telephone number is (571)272-4875. The examiner can normally be reached on normal weekday business hours (east coast time).

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Cheryl J. Tyler can be reached on 571 272 4834. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Stephen M. Gravini/
Primary Examiner, Art Unit 3744